

The Toxic Fruit of Reformed Theology, Part 1: Replacement Theology



By Kelleigh Nelson

March 12, 2024

Wherever replacement theology has flourished, the Jews have had to run for cover. –Thomas Ice

When the Ark of the Covenant was being brought up to Jerusalem, King David could be seen “leaping and dancing before the Lord” with “all his might” (2 Samuel 6:14-16). This evoked strong displeasure from his wife, Michal, who was left barren for having despised the joy of the Lord in her husband’s heart. How full the church is today of Michals who despise those who are rejoicing in the nacham (comfort), racham (compassion), and chesed (loyal covenant love) of God toward His people. How spiritually barren the church is where love for Israel is absent. –Paul Wilkinson, author, [Israel The Inheritance of God](#)

If God has not spoken in His Word about replacing, fulfilling, retelling, enlarging, redefining, nullifying, reconstituting, universalizing, reinterpreting, incorporating, renewing, or even “Christifying” Israel, then how are the church speak this way! –Andrew Robinson, [Israel Betrayed Volume I: The History of Replacement Theology](#).

There is a preciseness in the exegesis of the above-mentioned books, along with Dr. Arnold Fruchtenbaum’s approach to

teaching the scriptures. It is a preciseness that many decades ago resonated with my soul.

As a youngster, I was raised in a Jewish neighborhood, grew up with Jewish friends, dated Jewish men, and always had an affinity for both Israel and her people. It was no surprise then, that a Jewish man led me to the doctrinal truth of scripture so many decades ago. Yes, Jewish folks can lead gentiles to truth. The Lord works in mysterious ways, his wonders to perform.

Long before that time, I had studied antisemitism in the Church for a number of years, and was appalled at the "teaching of contempt" which resonated from the false doctrine of "Replacement Theology," especially in the "reformed" protestant churches. The study of this lamentable portion of Christian history, and the departure and deviation of its original foundation is anathema to those who know Biblical truth. As such, we must act against this evil and uphold the original bedrock of faith. The tragic results of anti-Semitic replacement theology is an indictment against the Church.

This series of articles will hopefully explain the core of the rot found in our churches today. We must remember that not all who are congregants of these various denominations understand the false doctrine or are even aware. There can be no blanket condemnation of those who attend these churches, but only a denouncement of the heretical doctrine which has permeated the church and society in a vastly evil and catastrophic way against Israel and the Jewish people.

Replacement Theology

Replacement Theology is a huge subject, one that would take countless historical studies to fully understand. In the first century, the Church was poisoned with rotten fruit that grew into a forest of libel against God's people, ultimately causing death and destruction throughout history. It is also

known as *Supersessionism*, from the word supersede, and *Fulfillment Theology*. In simple terms, it is the belief that the Church has replaced Israel and the Jewish people in the New Testament in terms of God's calling and His promises.

This means that Israel plays no role in current and future world affairs and where the NT mentions "Israel" it refers to the Church. This belief stems from the idea that due to the Jew's rejection of Jesus Christ as their Messiah, their place in the Promise has been forfeited to the Church.

Clearly stated, "Replacement Theology" is an unbiblical heretical doctrine and has destroyed the true church proper. It is a curse laid upon the cornerstone of truth, that the twelve tribes of Israel are no longer of interest to our Creator. The One True God, our Creator, loves His people Israel and will never forsake His promises to them.

The objective is not to trash Christianity, but to reassess and if possible, remove the false tenets which are damaging to Jews, Christians and the rest of humanity. We have seen that damage throughout history. In our lifetime, the Shoah, and now the worldwide outpouring of anti-Semitism against Israel and her people while they are at war with terrorists who mercilessly slaughtered men, women, children and babies.

This false doctrine is the decay and effect of ecclesiastical hatred and contempt for the Jews and Jewishness within the early church, by those considered Church Fathers, who were responsible for the evil perpetrated by the church throughout the centuries against God's people, Israel. Ignorance of this subject is extremely detrimental to all Christian life.

The Lord has an Eternal Plan

In a February, 2024 article by Dr. Tim Sigler, entitled "Israel's Current Conflict and God's Eternal Plan," he tells of being asked to speak to all three services at a church regarding what is happening in Israel. The pastor told him

that he could not preach on these things adequately. He was right. There is a lack of clear biblical teaching and preaching about the role of Israel in God's plan, about how to understand current issues in light of Scripture, and about how to navigate biblically the ethical challenges that receive lots of one-sided coverage in the culture at large.

Dr. Sigler spoke to the congregations about why Israel is special to God and God's choice of Israel to be the recipient of covenant blessings. He listed four verses.

- To be blessed by God and be a blessing to all the families of the earth. (Gen. 12:3)
- To be the inheritors of the land of promise. (Gen. 28:13)
- To have God's special favor from generation to generation. (Deut. 7:7-9)
- To have a line of kings from which an ultimate righteous ruler would come.

(2 Samuel 7:11-16)

Dr. Sigler went on to explain that even in the Christian New Testament (Romans 11:28-32), God's promises to the Jewish people, the descendants of Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, are beloved of the Lord because of God's covenantal promises given to the fathers, meaning the patriarchs of Israel. And the Lord's promises never change.

The pastor of this church is right, few gentile preachers teach in any depth about the Lord's covenants with His people, Israel.

Early Heresy

Elements of Replacement Theology can be traced as far back as [Marcion](#) (A.D. 85 – 160), who carried on a theological crusade to purge the Church of what he perceived to be dangerous Jewish errors and influences. Later, many of these same anti-

Judaic sentiments found their way into the thinking (and writings) of the Early Church fathers. [Irenaeus](#) (c.180) wrote, "The Jews have rejected the Son of God and cast Him out of the vineyard when they slew Him." Anyone who has read the New Testament words of Christ knows this is a lie, as Jesus himself said in John 10:18, "No man taketh it from me, but I lay it down of myself. I have power to lay it down, and I have power to take it again. This commandment have I received of my Father."

There is much that has happened to the church throughout history, but the Real Great Schism was brought about by the work of the second century [Patristic Fathers](#) who took the Church away from the Synagogue and cleansed it of Jewishness. This is how the Church became different from the Apostolic Church and left the truth of scriptures.

[Justin Martyr](#), in the second century, was one of the first Patristic Fathers who as an intellectual with literary skill was able to pull together the defense of Christian beliefs, refute non-Christian teachings and his numerous anti-Jewish diatribes in a manner that resonated with other elitists within the church. His focus was on Moses' Law. He called it burdensome, that neither Abraham nor other patriarchs lived under the Law, that it was abrogated with Christ, that Christians should not and do not live under the Law of Moses, but under the New Law which is Christ, that the Jews never really understood Scripture given by Moses and the Prophets, but now is understood by Christians which makes the Church the true Israel. Justin provided the Christians with an argument well packed with hateful theological rational.

In the process of defending Christianity, Justin articulated a set of Christian tenets which no other Christian apologist could outdo later. Every single tenet of Christian anti-Jewish theology of the Middle Ages is found in the two works of Justin (Apologies and the Dialogue with Trypho).

Those who followed suit after Justin (Irenaeus, Origen, Tertullian, John Chrysostom, Augustine, Ambrose, and others) honed and polished the tenets Justin himself had already created. None of them added any new tenet to Justin's anti-Jewish philosophy; they only elaborated upon them and adapted them to the current conditions of their own world.

The Patristic Fathers and their destruction of the true church and their movement away from the synagogue has caused massive evil. Justin Martyr's writings reveal not only his hatred for the Jews as a people, but for the Torah.

The Hebrew Bible and America's Founding Fathers

The political discourse of America's founding, for one example, is [replete with appeals to the Hebrew "republic" as a model for their own political experiment](#). In an influential 1775 Massachusetts election sermon, Samuel Langdon, the president of Harvard College and later a delegate to New Hampshire's constitution ratifying convention, opined: "The Jewish government, according to the original constitution which was divinely established, ... was a perfect Republic ... The civil Polity of Israel is doubtless an excellent general model ...; at least some principal laws and orders of it may be copied, to great advantage, in more modern establishments." Most of what the founders knew about the Hebraic republic they learned from the Bible. The republican model found in the Hebrew Scriptures, however, reassured pious Americans that republicanism was a political system favored by God.

Our once robust society and Godly culture are no longer what our founders envisioned. Our second US President, John Adams said, "Our constitution was made only for a moral and religious people. It is wholly inadequate to the government of any other." Morality and virtue are the foundation of our republic and necessary for a society to be free.

The believers' debt to Hebrew Scripture, Jewish exegesis, and

divine revelation were evident to all of God's people. In fact, Jewish-Christian relations, in spite of second and third century Christian elitist assaults upon all things Jewish, continued with good rhythm and solid relationship until the mid-fourth century with the advent of the First Council of Nicaea. At the Council of Nicaea, under Constantine's oversight, the Church formally disconnected from the Jewish roots of Christian theology and practice by separating the celebration of Easter from the Celebration of Passover.

With time, this theological approach has gained momentum and has been the instigator of many atrocities carried out against the Jews.

The fruits of Replacement Theology have been the foundation of almost two millennia of Jew-hatred known as anti-Semitism. Its doctrine has enabled fallen man's evil instincts to enjoy unlimited acts of horror, terror and extreme violence towards the Jewish people.

Hundreds, if not thousands, of episodes rooted in historical Jew-hatred have manifested themselves under the guise of this doctrine – for example, the infamous Spanish inquisition when 200,000 Jews were expelled from Spain by the Catholic Church. Tens of thousands were slaughtered, purposely drowned in the sea, or their bodies ripped open after rumors spread that Jews who were fleeing had swallowed their gold and silver items.

Sails of Hope

[Sails of Hope](#) by Simon Wiesenthal asks the question, "Was Columbus Jewish?" That would be a shock to those who believe he was Italian while many claim he was Portuguese. However, Wiesenthal spent five years researching this completely factual, radical re-interpretation of the events which led to the discovery of the New World and changed the course of history.

From the back of Simon Wiesenthal's book comes the following:

“We herewith decree that all the Jews living in Our dominions, without distinction of sex and age, must leave Our royal possessions and seigneuries, together with their sons and daughters and their Jewish servants...and let them not presume to set foot again in the land for the purpose of settlement, or to pass through to some other land, or for any purpose whatsoever.” Royal Edict of Expulsion

By midnight, August 2, 1492, all Jews must leave Spanish soil.

That same night, the three sailing ships which are to carry Christopher Columbus on his voyage of discovery are anchored quietly in Palos harbor, and although they are not scheduled to embark until the following day, Columbus has ordered his crew to be on board by eleven o'clock that night. A Hebrew translator, Luis de Torres, will accompany the expedition, but strangely enough, not a single priest is included.

The auspicious coincidence of these two events, compounded with the intense mystery which has always surrounded the identity of Columbus, has led to a complete re-examination of all previously accepted theories about the true nature of his mission.

Conclusion

So many have asked, “Where is the Church?” As Dr. Sigler well knows, today’s church leaders are bereft of the truth regarding the Lord’s eternal promises to the Jewish people and have long ago left the original doctrinal veracity of the Apostolic age.

In upcoming portions of this series, the more famous Church fathers who expounded on Justin’s Replacement theology, will be discussed, including Tertullian, Chrysostom, Augustin, Origen and Constantine, all of this leading to today’s Christian Palestinianism.

E-Mail Kelleigh Nelson: proverbs133@bellsouth.net